

FEDERAL ELECTION COMMISSION Washington, DC 20463

Paul G. Joyce, Esq. Colucci & Gallaher, P.C. 2000 Liberty Building 424 Main Street Buffalo, New York 14202-3695

MAY 1 8 2017

RE: MUR 7144

Dear Mr. Joyce:

On October 7, 2016, the Federal Election Commission ("Commission") notified your clients, Christopher L. Jacobs and Martina V. Rehorik, of a Complaint alleging violations of the Federal Election Campaign Act of 1971, as amended. On May 11, 2017, based upon the information contained in the Complaint, and information provided by your clients, the Commission found that there is no reason to believe that Christopher L. Jacobs or Martina V. Rehorik violated 52 U.S.C. § 30122, and no reason to believe that Ms. Rehorik violated 52 U.S.C. § 30121.

Documents related to the case will be placed on the public record within 30 days. See Disclosure of Certain Documents in Enforcement and Other Matters, 81 Fed. Reg. 50,702 (Aug. 2, 2016). The Factual and Legal Analysis, which explains the Commission's findings, is enclosed for your information.

If you have any questions, please contact Roy Q. Luckett, the attorney assigned to this matter, at (202) 694-1650.

Sincerely,

Mark Allen

Assistant General Counsel

Enclosure
Factual and Legal Analysis

FEDERAL ELECTION COMMISSION

FACTUAL AND LEGAL ANALYSIS

MUR: 7144

RESPONDENTS: Christopher I

Christopher L. Jacobs

Martina V. Rehorik

Jeb 2016, Inc. and William Simon in his official capacity as treasurer

I. INTRODUCTION

This matter was generated by a Complaint filed by Beatriz Lebron. The Complaint alleges that Christopher L. Jacobs made a contribution in the name of Martina V. Rehorik to Jeb 2016, Inc., the principal campaign committee of 2016 presidential candidate John Ellis Bush ("Committee"), in violation of the Federal Election Campaign Act of 1971, as amended (the "Act"). The Complaint further alleges that Rehorik may have been a foreign national and "thereby ineligible to make contributions to a federal candidate." For the reasons described below, the Commission finds no reason to believe that Jacobs, Rehorik, or the Committee violated 52 U.S.C. § 30122 by making or receiving a contribution in the name of another, and no reason to believe that Rehorik or the Committee violated 52 U.S.C. § 30121 by making or receiving a foreign national contribution.

II. FACTUAL BACKGROUND

On June 29, 2015, Jacobs contributed the maximum allowable limit of \$2,700 to the Committee; the Committee reported the contribution in its 2015 July Quarterly Report, listing Jacobs' employer as "Erie County" and his occupation as "Government." On July 15, 2015, Rehorik also made a \$2,700 contribution to the Committee; the Committee reported the

Compl. at 1 (Oct. 3, 2016).

² Jeb 2016, Inc. Amended 2015 July Quarterly Report (January 31, 2016) at 715, available at http://docquery.fec.gov/pdf/580/201601319005221580/201601319005221580.pdf.

. 3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

contribution on its 2015 October Quarterly Report and listed her employer as "Erie County" and

2 occupation as "County Clerk."³

The Complaint makes two allegations related to these contributions. First, the Complaint alleges that Jacobs, who had already contributed the maximum allowable limit of \$2,700 to the Committee on June 29, also made the \$2,700 contribution that was reported as having been made by Rehorik on July 15. The Complaint points out that Jacobs is employed as the Erie County Clerk, but "County Clerk" was listed under the occupation field for Rehorik's reported contribution. Complainant asserts that "Ms. Rehorik's use of Mr. Jacobs' title appears to be a way for Mr. Jacobs to let the Bush campaign know that the contribution was made on [Jacobs] behalf." The Complaint also maintains that it was unlikely that Rehorik could afford to make such a large contribution, as public information indicates that Rehorik earned a salary of \$41,317 as an employee in the office of the County Clerk of Erie County and her \$2,700 contribution is much larger than her previous contributions.

Jacobs and Rehorik each deny that Rehorik's contribution was actually made by Jacobs, asserting that the Complainant "lacks the facts to make an informed statement" about her finances, as Rehorik's employment with the Erie County Clerk's Office ended almost 18 months prior to her making the contribution at issue.⁷ Jacobs and Rehorik further state that Rehorik

Jeb 2016, Inc. Amended 2015 October Quarterly Report (January 31, 2016) at 2405, available at http://docquery.fec.gov/pdf/061/201601319005228061/201601319005228061.pdf.

Compl. at 1.

⁵ *Id*.

⁶ *Id*.

Joint Response of Christopher L. Jacobs and Martina V. Rehorik ("Joint Resp.") at 2 (Nov. 3, 2016). Rehorik documents that her employment ended at the Erie County Clerk's Office on February 5, 2014. See id. Attach. (letter from Peggy A. Lagree, Erie County First Deputy County Clerk, Oct. 20, 2016).

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

- "made the donation with her own funds and of her own volition," and that her post-Erie County
- 2 Clerk's Office employment has provided her with ample funds to do so.⁸ They also deny that
- 3 Rehorik's contribution "was made 'to let the Bush campaign know that the contribution was on'
- 4 Mr. Jacob's behalf." The Committee, for its part, describes the Complaint's allegations as
- 5 "based on nothing more than speculation about two donors to the Committee." 10

III. LEGAL ANALYSIS

The Act and Commission regulations provide that no person shall make a contribution in the name of another person or knowingly permit his or her name to be used to effect such a contribution. Additionally, no person shall knowingly accept a contribution made by one person in the name of another. The available record does not suggest that Jacobs provided Rehorik with the funds for the contributions. Complainant primarily bases the allegation on inferences drawn from Rehorik's use of "County Clerk" when providing her occupation to the Committee, and from apparently outdated information about Rehorik's salary. This information does not support a reasonable inference that Jacobs made a contribution in Rehorik's name or that the Committee knowingly accepted any such contribution, and Jacobs and Rehorik specifically deny the allegation. Accordingly, we recommend that the Commission find no reason to believe that Christopher L. Jacobs or Martina V. Rehorik violated 52 U.S.C. § 30122

Id.

^{9 ·}*Id*.

Committee Response at 1 (Nov. 15, 2016).

⁵² U.S.C. § 30122; 11 C.F.R. § 110.4(b)(1)(i), (ii). In addition, "no person shall... knowingly help or assist any person in making a contribution in the name of another." 11 C.F.R. § 110.4(b)(1)(iii).

¹² *Id*.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

by making a contribution in the name of another, and no reason to believe that the Committee

2 violated 52 U.S.C. § 30122 by knowingly accepting a contribution in the name of another.

Second, the Complaint alleges that Rehorik was born outside of the United States, thereby indicating that she may be a foreign national ineligible to make a contributions to a federal candidate. The Act.provides that it is unlawful for a foreign national, directly or indirectly, to make a contribution or donation of money or other thing of value in connection with a Federal, State, or local election, and for a person to solicit, accept, or receive such a contribution or donation. The prohibition against contributions by foreign nationals does not

Rehorik asserts that she is not a "foreign national," as she obtained her green card on December 4, 1993, and such status is among the exceptions to the "foreign national" category as specified in 52 U.S.C. § 30121(b). ¹⁶ The available record does not include evidence refuting Rehorik's status as a green card holder with "the privilege of residing permanently in the United States," as the Complainant's allegation is based solely on an assertion that Rehorik was born

outside of the United States. 17 Therefore, the Commission finds no reason to believe that

apply to an individual who is a citizen of the United States or lawfully admitted for permanent

residence in the United States, including green card holders.¹⁵

Compl. at 1.

¹⁴ 52 U.S.C. § 30121(a).

See 52 U.S.C. § 30121(b) (providing that "the term 'foreign national' shall not include any individual who is a citizen of the United States" or an individual who is "lawfully admitted for permanent residence"); see also FEC, FOREIGN NATIONALS at 2 (July 2003), http://www.fec.gov/pages/brochures/foreign_nat_brochure.pdf (setting forth the "green card exception" whereby an immigrant may make a contribution if he or she has a "green card" indicating his or her lawful admittance for permanent residence in the United States.

Joint Resp. at 2.

See 8 U.S.C. § 1101(a)(20), cited in 52 U.S.C. § 30121(b)(2).

MUR 7144 (Christopher L. Jacobs et al.) Factual and Legal Analysis Page 5 of 5

- Martina V. Rehorik violated 52 U.S.C. § 30121 by making, and the Committee by accepting, a
- 2 foreign national contribution.